

## ENVIRONMENTALIST CINEMA AND PRINCIPLES OF JUST SOCIETY

**Giorgi Razmadze**

Ph.D. in Art History

Shota Rustaveli Theatre and Film Georgia State University Research Center

### **Abstract**

The UN Summit on Climate Change in Paris was held in 2015, at which the Framework Convention was signed by many countries around the world, including Georgia. The document is the basis of the EU Green Agreement, which was approved in 2019 and which doubles the commitment of Georgia, a member of the Eastern Partnership, to promote a green economy and culture, which not only is not the case but on the example of Namakhvani HPP reveals the fact that the country has been arranged according to a wrong economic model.

Cinema is the medium that has the most outstanding ability to reorganize the world and, therefore, has great potential. Cinema, as the screen of discourses best reflects a culture that stands out from the point of view of consumer values alike to ordinary people and nature, the environment, ecology. Marx's theory of fetishism, which has evolved since the advent of the term ideology, well explains the attitude of the culture towards natural (or human) resources.

We must not forget that a culture that is a conglomerate of discourses, and like discourses, it is produced by ideology (superstructure). Ideology possesses the intellectual levers through which the dominant forces, the classes, are established by presenting the values of this class as the "norm". Culture, therefore, is directed to save the verticals of power by concealing problems, or by telling incomplete truth. Nevertheless, it is a culture that implies confrontation with the laws of nature and discourses based on those laws. However, first and foremost, capitalist ideology seeks to adapt thought systems to itself, including culture.

Georgian cinema has always had an ideological line, but in the 1960's the process of devaluation of communism in intellectual and creative circles shifted the focus to the problem of individualism. For example, in several of Merab Kokochashvili's films, the mainline is drawn between the relationship of the individual and the environment, where the apparatus (state) is presented only as a clear source of evil. It is regulations that create the environmental context that is the only way to stop profit-oriented destructive systems. Neither competition nor individual or corporate responsibility can solve ecological disasters and human exploitation problems.

In modern Georgian cinema, there are more and more attempts to extract a broader holistic picture of the impact on the environment. Salome Jashi explores the whim of the richest Georgian - the passion for arranging a dendrological park with centuries-old trees, which is a class catastrophe along with an ecological catastrophe. Alexander Koberidze's "What do we see when we look at the sky?" asks the main question, "What do we answer our children" when they discover that they live in an unjust world that is sacrificed to the greed of a small number of people in power.

**Keywords:** political art; The logic of capitalism; Environmental protection; Contemporary Georgian cinema.

## Introduction

The environmental movement in art is born in conjunction with conceptual art. The minimalism from which Land Art originated will look at the environment and ecology from a new perspective. Conceptual art, led by Joseph Kosuth, brings art back to the political arena, while Hans Haacke calls on artists to make "politically engaged" art.<sup>1</sup>

In the second half of the twentieth century, art protest took on more concrete and earthly forms than it did before World War II. If previously Luis Buñuel and Max Ernst criticized culture as such, new post-war waves engage in specific political discussion. They aim to explore the world that made World War II possible, and with the war came the concept of segregation, colonialism, exploitation, ecological catastrophes, militarism, and expansion, both militarily and culturally, as globalism and other forms of oppression.

The aim of this article is to understand capitalism through the example of the anti-capitalist movements in both art and green politics that aim to control and regulate production for the benefit of the planet.

### 1. The Beginnings of Understanding Capitalism in Postwar Art

Modern green politics is based on just such anti-capitalist movements that emerged in the West in the 1960s. Environmentalism refers to the study of cultural-economic models based on fetishistic logic, according to which the exploitation of natural resources proceeds in the same way as before (and now) human resources were treated by excellent classes. Capitalism was exposed and the mask was removed on all fronts in the 1960s, from conceptual art – we can recall Hans Haacke's installation in Krefeld in 1972 of the "Rhine Water Purification Plant", which filtered contaminated Rhine water into a museum and kept goldfish in the pond alive – The Beginnings of Understanding Capitalism in Postwar Art ending with the work of Greenpeace, which was created exactly one year before Haacke's exhibition.

Even today, when environmental movement in the United States, the European Union, and China, for example, is intensifying,<sup>2</sup> and almost every country is signing a green agreement at the initiative of the West,<sup>3</sup> it is due to a 1972 campaign launched by the "Rome Group", one of the oldest environmental societies, aimed at understanding the limits of natural minerals and other resources.<sup>4</sup>

The agreement,<sup>5</sup> signed in 2015, provided for the creation of a team of scientists to present a special report. Based on the findings of scientists, the US and the EU began working on a green agreement, in 2019 the

---

<sup>1</sup> "Art Is A Weapon: Hans Haacke on How Art Survived the Bush Administration", Artspace, February 3, 2017, [https://www.artspace.com/magazine/art\\_101/book\\_report/art-is-a-weapon-hans-haacke-interview-political-art-54590](https://www.artspace.com/magazine/art_101/book_report/art-is-a-weapon-hans-haacke-interview-political-art-54590) [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>2</sup> Lewis, J., Edwards, L., "Assessing China's Energy and Climate Goals", CAP, May 6, 2021, <https://www.americanprogress.org/article/assessing-chinas-energy-climate-goals/> [L. s.25.02.2022].

<sup>3</sup> The European Green Agreement was signed in Paris in 2015 and is signed by 196 countries. The document aims to halt the first carbon-neutral continent by 2050 (meaning Europe) and global warming.

<sup>4</sup> Meadows, D. H., Meadows, D. L., Randers, J., Behrens III, W. W., "The Limits to Growth", Universe Books, 1972.

<sup>5</sup> UN Framework Convention on Climate Change (Paris Agreement), in Georgian: <https://www.matsne.gov.ge/ka/document/download/3702467/0/ge/pdf>, in English: [https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/english\\_paris\\_agreement.pdf](https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/english_paris_agreement.pdf). [L. s. 25.02.2022].

EU approved the document, which includes 4 areas: 1. Energy, 2. Buildings, 3. Mobility and 4. Nutrition.<sup>6</sup> To this agreement was added the European Climate Pact, approved in 2020, which combines three areas and focuses on individual responsibility in all three areas.<sup>7</sup> This approach is very similar to the reckless campaigns of large corporations that began in the 1970's; for example, "Coca-Cola" developed a marketing strategy in which *individual responsibility*<sup>8</sup> for environmental pollution was underlined and the entire responsibility fell on consumers.<sup>9</sup> In this campaign, the corporation called on the buyer to properly manage the waste and said nothing about its own production, which in order to increase profits, moved from glass bottles to plastic packaging, which is still considered one of the main polluting components of the planet. In the pollution of the oceans "Coca-Cola" is followed by "Pepsi" – the second-largest corporation of Big Soda.<sup>10</sup>

Fighting against large capitalist forces has become an integral part of modern art. Artists have taken on a role that both the media and the non-governmental sector,<sup>11</sup> as well as government agencies and politicians in general, have been unable to cope with; who in fact are in deals with big corporations and often arrange political, economic and sometimes even military interventions in other countries.<sup>12</sup>

"Coca-Cola" has become a symbol of the United States, because before that, if we use the term of György Lukács, it will be subject to reification, that is, in the context of American politics, this product of mass production has developed as a symbol of capitalism. During the Cold War, "Coca-Cola", "Marlboro", and "Levi's" were freedom fighters for the people living beyond the Iron Curtain, for whom the apologetics of consumer relations in a pop culture beyond the curtain evoked fetishistic sentiments toward the West.

The ontology of carbonated beverages, as a chemical food industry in general, is based on the assumption of being a consumer, in the logic of which the consumer is also subject to reification. In this closed circle, capital – money – becomes the object of autonomous fetishization. In the next stage, capitalism is proclaimed as a sacred service to the ordinary consumers, whose every aspect of life is based on consumption – even entertainment is associated only with trade (an attitude of spending free time in shopping malls). Politicians, on the other hand, view the fetishization of money in the spectrum of political theology and prefer to establish the not-so-obvious dogma of capital accumulation to the solution of social

<sup>6</sup> Mikadze, E., "Europe Green Agreement and its Importance for Georgia", Heinrich Boell Foundation, February 18, 2021, [https://ge.boell.org/ka/2021/02/18/evropis-mcvane-shetankhmeba-damisi-mnishvneloba-sakartvelostvis#\\_ftnref9](https://ge.boell.org/ka/2021/02/18/evropis-mcvane-shetankhmeba-damisi-mnishvneloba-sakartvelostvis#_ftnref9) [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>7</sup> European Commission, "The European Green Deal", Brussels, 11 January, <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?qid=1576150542719&uri=COM%3A2019%3A640%3AFIN>, [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>8</sup> Personal responsibility is the idea in conservatism and libertarianism that people are responsible for the actions they commit or cause. Corporations use this idea to avoid liability for humans and the planet. According to them, the consumption of sugar or nicotine depends on a person's free choice. Also, in the case of ecology, the planet is not polluted by the products they produce, but by the consumers of those products.

<sup>9</sup> Nestle, M., "Soda Politics: Taking on Big Soda (and Winning)", Oxford University Press, 2015, p. 280.

<sup>10</sup> Big Soda is a term that, like Big Oil and Big Tobacco, refers to a conglomerate of carbonated beverage corporations. In this case, the two corporations of Big Soda are considered to be the major polluters of the planet's oceans. See "Holding Corporations Accountable for the Plastic & Climate Crisis, 2021", *BRANDED*, Vol. IV., 2021, <https://www.breakfreefromplastic.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/BRAND-AUDIT-REPORT-2021.pdf>, [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>11</sup> Noam Chomsky explores the unity of the American media and non-governmental sector with the government. See Chomsky, N., Herman, S. E., "Consent Making: The Political Economy of the Media", Pantheon Books, 1988.

<sup>12</sup> "The head of PepsiCo is asking President Nixon for help in protecting the interests of the corporation in Chile in the early 1970s, which was won by a force unfriendly to US corporations. The U.S. intervention led to the overthrow and assassination of Chilean President Salvador Allende. Pepsi's similar interference is attributed to Guatemala's internal affairs. Coca-Cola has long been accused of killing a trade union leader in Guatemala in 1978 who worked for their company. "Coca-Cola's labor rights problem in the country lasted until the 1990s, when it was boycotted by trade unions in protest of the company's violent policies." Source: Nestle M., cf. Footnote 9, p. 207.

problems.<sup>13</sup> Deviations from the canonical approaches of capitalism, such as slowing down economic development, raising taxes for the rich, caring for the expansion of the welfare state, and so on, are declared heresies.<sup>14</sup>

Donald Trump withdrew the US from the Paris Agreement in 2017, citing that the decision will help American companies in the extraction of fossils.<sup>15</sup> Trump is based on the weathered notion that man lives in the binary of nature and culture, as Claude Lévi-Strauss explained, on the example of primitive societies,<sup>16</sup> and that the taming of nature is, to some extent, not only the norm but also the cultural debt.

Exactly about subordination to nature is Salome Jashi's documentary "Taming the Garden" (2021), which tells the story of the creation of Shekvetili Dendrological Park, however, actually show us a x-ray picture of how we went against nature and not planted a dendrological park (i.e. growing trees, as it is generally the idea in a species protection park) but created it with perennial trees.

## 2. Georgian Cinema and Capitalism

Behind Shekvetili Park stands the richest and most influential politician, the former Prime Minister of Georgia Bidzina Ivanishvili, who decided to arrange a park near his residence. We hardly see these details in the film, but over time we learn from the conversations of the characters in the films that Ivanishvili's representatives are buying trees from the population of western Georgia. Some refuse, some agree, again and again due to unbearable social status.<sup>17</sup>

The film begins with an image of a forest in which white smoke explores its path. It will be followed by the noise of special equipment and music that prepares the viewer for the impending attack on nature. And indeed, both in the film and in the media before, we have seen the ecological catastrophes that followed the uprooting and transportation of each tree. We also observed the collapse of the state, which not only expressed its powerlessness in the face of the capital, but also stood at its service. The result of the epic tree transportation, in the words of Salome Jashi, is an event beyond good and evil<sup>18</sup> – Shekvetili Dendrological Park, where trees are attached to the ground with the cords, artificially cultivated forest is irrigated with an irrigation system, and electric vehicles drive on the paths.

---

<sup>13</sup> To explain the phantasmagoric relationship with the object, which he calls fetishism, Marx refers to the "religiously vague realm." See Marx, K., "Capital", Volume I, Book I, Tbilisi: Sakhelgami, 1954, p. 96. (in georgian) Max Weber extends this view to the concept of disenchantment, which in Georgian translates as "de-magic-ation". See M. Weber, "The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism," London and New York: Routledge, 2005. Consider Capitalism as a Religion Walter Benjamin's essay, Capitalism as a Religion. He says, "Capitalism is an ancient religious culture, without dogmas." See Benjamin, W., "Capitalism as Religion", 1921, available here: <https://cominsitu.wordpress.com/2018/06/08/capitalism-as-religion-benjamin-1921/> [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>14</sup> Speaking at the opening of the 74th session of the UN General Assembly in 2019, Donald Trump named socialism as the main enemy of the planet: "One of the most serious challenges facing our countries is the ghost of socialism. He is the destroyer of nations and the destroyer of societies". See, Remarks by President Trump to the 74th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, United Nations Headquarters, New York, September 24, 2019, available here: <https://trumpwhitehouse.archives.gov/briefings-statements/remarks-president-trump-74th-session-united-nations-general-assembly/> [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>15</sup> Easley, J., "Trump cements 'America First' doctrine with Paris withdrawal", *The Hill*, June 2, 2017, available here: <https://thehill.com/homenews/administration/336014-trump-cements-america-first-doctrine-with-paris-withdrawal>, [L.s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>16</sup> Lévi-Strauss, C., "The Elementary Structures of Kinship", Beacon Press, 1971, p. 3.

<sup>17</sup> In various interviews, Salome Jashi focuses on the motivation for selling wood, that some of the money received was used to finance their children's surgery, etc. cf. C. Nadibaidze, "Salome Jashi Documentary 'Taming the Garden'", *Indigo*, February 1, 2021, available here: <https://indigo.com.ge/articles/salome-jashis-dokumenturi-filmi-motviniereba/> [L.s. 25.02.2022]; Razmadze, G., "Paradise... Paradise? Interview with Salome Jashi", *Kino*, # 3, 2021, p. 75.

<sup>18</sup> Razmadze, G., see footnote 17, p. 77.

This park is not only a symbol of the taming of nature, but also a symbol of subordination of nature by a human. What the feudal lords of ancient times did with sacral legitimacy, modern capitalist feudal lords<sup>19</sup> base their power on money, especially when in this system money is not merely exchanged, and it becomes a source of mythical or metaphysical legitimacy through fetishization.

Salome Jashi sneaks into the Garden of Power, which is spread across the country, as noted by the famous English critic Peter Bradshaw.<sup>20</sup> The shooting of the Dendrological Park is a political manifestation of Salome Jashi, who exposes power in exactly the same way that Haake treated institutions and people with power and capital behind them in his series of museums and other investigative projects (MoMA Poll, A Real-Time Social System, Manet/Projekt, The Chocolate Master and so on).

In one of the interviews, Jashi says that she is often asked why he continues to live in Georgia, to which he replies, "Because it makes me angry".<sup>21</sup> It is the television image that will become the inspiration for this film, a tree floating in the sea that has become an icon of subordination of nature.

Jashi worked in television for a while and is well acquainted with this medium, the power of television imagery, which became the inspiration for her film. Mass communications play exactly the same role in the modern world as art did in the era of classical feudalism, which was still the producer of the value of the ruling elites, hence the classes. Marx called it the superstructure, which was based on oppression to the extent that it was engaged in strengthening the instruments of oppression.<sup>22</sup>

Art theorist Boris Groys views contemporary images as a conduit and service to ideology. Takes the example of terrorism and explains the notable aspects of this relatively new phenomenon:

"... as being the "icons" of the hidden, terrible reality that is for us the global political reality of our time. I would say: These images are the icons of the contemporary political theology that dominates our collective imagination".<sup>23</sup>

The ideology in the new mass communication media formed as a result of globalization, which stands for the fetishization of commodities, serves to assert the feudalism of the big capitalists. Despite a lot of manipulation, environmental issues are a rubicon that manipulative logic cannot overcome- Even Margaret Thatcher spoke from the UN tribune on the need for climate protection (However, according to some, she needed environmental protection to destroy the coal miners' unions, although we have no direct evidence of this).<sup>24</sup>

Hence, the activism of previous years has yielded some results, although the green policy still devotes itself to commodity fetishism. Even in the EU Green Agreement, we see a lot of concessions and loyalties towards

<sup>19</sup> The term "big capitalist feudalism" was used by George Stuart Mill in his paper "Socialism" (J. S. Mill, "Socialism: The Subjugation of Women", ebooks, 2021, p. 25. (in georgian)), which in turn was based on Joseph Fourier's notion of "industrial (La féodalité industrielle), which is also explained in detail by the French socialist thinker Victor Consideran in "Social Fate" (V. Considerant, "Destinée Sociale", tome premier, Au Bureau de la Phalange, 1835, p. 194).

<sup>20</sup> Bradshaw, P., "Taming the Garden review -fascinating study of a billionaire's destructive folly", *The Guardian*, January 25, 2022, available here: <https://www.theguardian.com/film/2022/jan/25/taming-the-garden-review-fascinating-study-of-a-billionaires-destructive-folly> [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>21</sup> Wissot, L., "It Was Such a Jiggle of Consciousness, Such a Beautiful Monstrosity...", filmmaker, February 1, 2021, <https://filmmakermagazine.com/111029-it-was-such-a-jiggle-of-consciousness-such-a-beautiful-monstrosity-salome-jashi-on-her-sundance-debuting-taming-the-garden/#.Yfbsuy8RphA> [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>22</sup> Balibar, E., "Marx Philosophy", Verso, 2007, p. 50-51.

<sup>23</sup> Groys, B., "Art Power", The MIT Press, 2008, p. 125.

<sup>24</sup> Margaret Thatcher's Speech to the United Nations General Assembly (Global Environment), United Nations Building, New York, November 8, 1989, <https://www.margarethatcher.org/document/107817> [L. s.25.02.2022].

big corporations, which are given preferential terms until 2030 and maybe even till 2050. And just at that time Alexander Koberidze's not so the rhetorical question is heard, which he voices in his film "What we see when we look at the sky?" (2021): – "What do we say to our children..."

There are many important shots, episodes or scenes in Koberidze's film, about which much can be said both aesthetically or in terms of a form, as well as for the content and metaphor. This time, however, I would like to highlight the author's direct address, which is expressed in the so-called interlude of the film, between the first and second parts, in the best traditions of Greek theater.

"It would probably be appropriate to say a few words about when the story has happened, said the narrator, whom we are watching together. – What was that time like? – the time was cruel. Merciless. I have no doubt that future people will remember this time as cruel. Just as we find it hard to imagine how people engaged in daily activities when the most heinous crimes were being committed around them, neither can future generations explain our indifference to what is happening around us. For example, how we treat our sisters and brothers in the animal kingdom is unprecedent for history. This year, during fires on various continents alone – in fires caused by greed – an estimated 1,250,000,000 living things were killed. One billion two hundred and fifty million! Infinite examples can be given, but probably it is enough. We have a rough idea of when this story happened [the time in the film, G.R.] and as the children of that time are accustomed to, we should not overlook the above and go back to the narrative."

And towards the finale of the film, with an image of Khvamli Mountain on the background (near which the Turkish company "Enka Renewables" tried and is still trying to build a cascade of hydropower plants, which will destroy the ecology of western Georgia,<sup>25</sup> without receiving any energy or financial benefits<sup>26</sup>) Koberidze takes the viewer out of the film again and addresses him again, this time with a more personal text than in the background of a soccer ball thrown in the river Rioni, which we have already quoted above: "What do I say to my children when they ask me what was the cause of such cruelty, such helplessness. When they ask me, when all this was happening, what was I doing ... I think, because I know they ask me, I do not even have an answer. What can I say, I was making movies ?!".

We can say that Koberidze made a film about greed. The greed that threatens to destroy the magical world that is portrayed in the "what we see when we look at the sky?." The film tells a phantasmagoric story, the love story of a pharmacist girl from Kutaisi and a football player boy, how they meet by chance, how they set a date and how the curse will change the appearance of the young people. Both will appear at the appointed time and place, but obviously they can not recognize each other. During the course of the film, they still fall in love with each other and only in the finale, thanks to the movie, will the curse disappear. The question of the enchantment and breaking the curse of the world is connected with capitalism, which, according to Max Weber, arises in a world that is no longer enchanted by the rationalism of the enlightenment, but then itself becomes a secular religion.<sup>27</sup>

---

<sup>25</sup> Green Alternative Report, "Namakhvani HPP Cascade Under Violation", February 21, 2021, <https://greenalt.org/namakhvan-hesebis-kaskadis-mshenebloba-kanonis-darghvevit-mimdinareobs/> [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>26</sup> The conclusion of the Center for Social Justice, "Namakhvani Cascade Project contains legal violations, high social and environmental risks", July 22, 2020, <https://socialjustice.org.ge/ka/products/emc-namakhvanis-kaskadis-proekti-samartlebriv-darghvevebs-maghal-sotsialur-da-ekologiur-riskebs-sheitsavs> [L. s. 25.02.2022].

<sup>27</sup> Weber, M., cf. Footnote 13.

This fabulous plot can be said to be secondary to the many layers of the film that explore the urban space, the unity of the inhabitants of this city – people and animals – with the urban space built on legends and memory. Koberidze is interested in this energy, which he is trying to accumulate in the medium of cinema, so that we know what we will lose when we do not resist the greed for capital.

Groys writes:

"Art always attempted to represent the greatest possible power, the power that ruled the world in its totality – be it divine or natural power. Thus, as its representation, art traditionally drew its own authority from this power. In this sense art has always been directly or indirectly critical because it confronts finite, political power with images of the infinite – God, nature, fate, life, death".<sup>28</sup>

Alexander Koberidze, together with Salome Jashi, introduced a new type of political activism in Georgian cinema. If before the criticism of the system was always followed by public criticism (neo) liberal concept of individual responsibility (we can recall the films of Nana Ekvimishvili and Simon Gross: "In Bloom" (2013), "My Happy Family" (2017) and many other films of "New Georgian Cinema") first of all, Jashi and Koberidze treat the environment and time<sup>29</sup> with care and as a result of the time-consuming process of observation and study, and instead of blaming people, they offer to discuss the roots of the events

Groys views political activism as an integral part of contemporary art. He considers art as a medium and arena for political and social activism:

"The art activists do not want to merely criticize the art system or the general political and social conditions under which this system functions. Rather, they want to change these conditions by means of art – not so much inside the art system as outside it, that is, change the conditions of reality itself. Art activists try to change living conditions in economically underdeveloped areas, raise ecological concerns, offer access to culture and education to the populations of poor countries and areas, attract attention to the plight of illegal immigrants, improve conditions for people working in art institutions. In other words, art activists react to the increasing collapse of the modern social state and try to substitute for social institutions and NGOs that for different reasons cannot or will not fulfil their role".<sup>30</sup>

## Conclusion

The fact that Georgia occupies the worst position in terms of environmental and social state compared to the West is, of course, the merit of the neoliberal agenda. The architect of this arrangement is the Russian oligarch Kakha Bendukidze, who after the "Rose Revolution" came to Georgia from Russia at the invitation of Zurab Zhvania, who more or less suddenly begins to pursue a neoliberal policy. During his tenure (2004-8), almost all enterprises or sectors of the economy of strategic importance fell into the hands of Russian companies and oligarchs. Political elites, the media, and the leading non-governmental sector refrain from evaluating Bendukidze's reforms, and remain silent about the consequences (of Russia's economic and political power). It is at this point that artists at the forefront of the public movement should prepare the

<sup>28</sup> Groys, B., cf. Footnote 23, p. 2.

<sup>29</sup> Alexander Koberidze lived in Kutaisi for a year before starting filming. Salome Jashi sent a researcher to the site during the preparation period and only after that a „personal research" started on the spot. See G. Razmadze, cf. Footnote 17, p. 74.

<sup>30</sup> Groys, B., "In the Flow", Verso, 2016, p. 36.

decolonial movement against the "destructive economic model"<sup>31</sup> as Heidi Hautala, a member of the Greens / European Freedom Alliance and Vice President of the European Parliament evaluated the protest against the Namakhvani HPP - a protest that exposed the vicious side of Bendukidze's subsequent political and economic formation.

---

<sup>31</sup> MEP Heidi Hautala on Protest Against Namakhvani HPP", Interpressnews, June 2, 2021, <https://www.interpressnews.ge/ka/article/658954-evroparliamentari-haidi-hautala-namaxvanthesis-sacinaotbime-sakartvelos-mosaxleobis-am-axali-saxis-mobilizacias-destrukciuli-ekonomikuri-modelis-cinaagmdeg/> [L. s. 25.02.2022].



### Bibliography

1. "Art Is A Weapon: Hans Haacke on How Art Survived the Bush Administration", Artspace, February 3, 2017, [https://www.artspace.com/magazine/art\\_101/book\\_report/art-is-a-weapon-hans-haacke-interview-political-art-54590](https://www.artspace.com/magazine/art_101/book_report/art-is-a-weapon-hans-haacke-interview-political-art-54590) [Last seen 25.02.2022];
2. Lewis, Joanna, Edwards, Laura, "Assessing China's Energy and Climate Goals", CAP, May 6, 2021, <https://www.americanprogress.org/article/assessing-chinas-energy-climate-goals/> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
3. Meadows, Dennis, Meadows, Donella, Randers, Jørgen, Behrens III, William W., "The Limits to Growth", Universe Books, 1972;
4. UN Framework Convention on Climate Change (Paris Agreement), in Georgian: <https://www.matsne.gov.ge/ka/document/download/3702467/0/ge/pdf>, in English: [https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/english\\_paris\\_agreement.pdf](https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/english_paris_agreement.pdf). [Last seen 25.02.2022];
5. Mikadze, Ekaterine, "Europe Green Agreement and its Importance for Georgia", Heinrich Boell Foundation, February 18, 2021, [https://ge.boell.org/ka/2021/02/18/evropis-mcvane-shetankhmeba-damisi-mnishvneloba-sakartvelostvis#\\_ftnref9](https://ge.boell.org/ka/2021/02/18/evropis-mcvane-shetankhmeba-damisi-mnishvneloba-sakartvelostvis#_ftnref9) [Last seen 25.02.2022];
6. European Commission, "The European Green Deal", Brussels, 11 January, <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legalcontent/EN/TXT/?qid=1576150542719&uri=COM%3A2019%3A640%3AFI>, [Last seen 25.02.2022];
7. Nestle, Marion, "Soda Politics: Taking on Big Soda (and Winning)", Oxford University Press, 2015;
8. "Holding Corporations Accountable for the Plastic & Climate Crisis, 2021", BRANDED, Vol. IV., 2021, <https://www.breakfreefromplastic.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/BRAND-AUDIT-REPORT-2021.pdf>, [Last seen 25.02.2022];
9. Chomsky, Noam, Herman, Edward S., "Consent Making: The Political Economy of the Media", Pantheon Books, New York, 1988;
10. Marx, Karl, "Capital", Volume I, Book I, Tbilisi: Sakhelgami, 1954, p. 96. (in georgiasn);
11. Weber, Max, "The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism," London and New York: Routledge, 2005;
12. Benjamin, Walter, "Capitalism as Religion", 1921, <https://cominsitu.wordpress.com/2018/06/08/capitalism-as-religion-benjamin-1921/> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
13. Remarks by President Trump to the 74th Session of the United Nations General Assembly, United Nations Headquarters, New York, September 24, 2019, <https://trumpwhitehouse.archives.gov/briefings-statements/remarks-president-trump-74th-session-united-nations-general-assembly/> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
14. Easley, Jonathan, "Trump cements 'America First' doctrine with Paris withdrawal", The Hill, June 2, 2017, <https://thehill.com/homenews/administration/336014-trump-cements-america-first-doctrine-with-paris-withdrawal> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
15. Lévi-Strauss, Claude, "The Elementary Structures of Kinship", Beacon Press, 1971;
16. Nadibaidze, Gvanca, "Salome Jashi Documentary 'Taming the Garden'", Indigo, February 1, 2021, <https://indigo.com.ge/articles/salome-jashis-dokumenturi-filmi-motviniereba/> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
17. Razmadze, Giorgi, "Paradise... Paradise? Interview with Salome Jashi", *Kino*, # 3, 2021;
18. Mill, John Stuart, "Socialism: The Subjugation of Women", ibooks, Tbilisi, 2021 (in georgian);

19. Considerant, Victor, "Destinée Sociale", tome premier, Au Bureau de la Phalange, 1835;
20. Bradshaw, Peter, "Taming the Garden review -fascinating study of a billionaire's destructive folly", The Guardian, January 25, 2022, <https://www.theguardian.com/film/2022/jan/25/taming-the-garden-review-fascinating-study-of-a-billionaires-destructive-folly> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
21. Wissot, Lauren, "It Was Such a Jiggle of Consciousness, Such a Beautiful Monstrosity...", filmmaker, February 1, 2021, <https://filmmakermagazine.com/111029-it-was-such-a-jiggle-of-consciousness-such-a-beautiful-monstrosity-salome-jashi-on-her-sundance-debuting-taming-the-garden/#.Yfbsuy8RphA> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
22. Balibar, Étienne, "Marx Philosophy", Verso, London and New Yourk, 2007;
23. Groys, Boris, "Art Power", The MIT Press, Cambridge and London, 2008;
24. Margaret Thatcher's Speech to the United Nations General Assembly (Global Environment), United Nations Building, New York, November 8, 1989, <https://www.margaretthatcher.org/document/107817> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
25. Green Alternative Report, "Namakhvani HPP Cascade Under Violation", February 21, 2021, <https://greenalt.org/namakhvan-hesebis-kaskadis-mshenebloba-kanonis-darghvevit-mimdinareobs/> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
26. The conclusion of the Center for Social Justice, "Namakhvani Cascade Project contains legal violations, high social and environmental risks", July 22, 2020, is <https://socialjustice.org.ge/ka/products/emc-namakhvanis-kaskadis-proekti-samartlebriv-darghvevebs-maghal-sotsialur-da-ekologiur-riskebs-sheitsavs> [Last seen 25.02.2022];
27. Groys, Boris, "In the Flow", Verso, London and New-york, 2016;
28. MEP Heidi Hautala on Protest Against Namakhvani HPP", Interpressnews, June 2, 2021, <https://www.interpressnews.ge/ka/article/658954-evroparliamentari-haidi-hautala-namaxvanhesis-sacinaotbime-sakartvelos-mosaxleobis-am-axali-saxis-mobilizacias-destrukciuli-ekonomikuri-modelis-cinaagmdeg/> [Last seen 25.02.2022].